



Command and Can't Control: Assessing Centralized Accountability in the Public Sector

Reproducibility package ID: RR_PAK_2023_61-v02

(Sixth submission)

Xuerong Lei, Luis Eduardo San Martin

reproducibility@worldbank.org

May 21, 2025

This review verifies the reproducibility of the exhibits included in the paper “*Command and Can't Control: Assessing Centralized Accountability in the Public Sector*”.

Contents in this review:

1. Main findings
2. List of exhibits and reproducibility status
3. Reproduction Environment

Main findings

- **Every exhibit has been reproduced accurately.**
- The code was successfully executed on a new computer after:
 1. Adjusting the global project folder in the do-file *master.do* to the reviewer's folder path
- The output demonstrates consistent stability across multiple runs. Specifically, executing the code two times consecutively yielded identical results.
- The code takes approximately 6 hours to run.
- We conducted our reproducibility analysis based on the paper shared by the authors via Dropbox on April 19, 2025.
- **Reproducibility Summary:**
 - **Data:** All data is restricted and has not been included in the reproducibility package. For more details, please refer to the README file.
 - **Code:** All code files (from cleaning to analysis) are included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Outputs:** All outputs are generated by code included in the reproducibility package.
 - **Reproducibility verification:** Reviewers used data provided directly by the authors to conduct the reproducibility verification, and this is not included in the public reproducibility package.
 - **Dependencies environment:** The reviewers reproduced an existing environment for dependencies using ado files provided by the authors.

List of exhibits and reproducibility status

Results in the Main Section of the Paper

- **Figure 1** Does not apply: the exhibit does not show analysis results
- **Figure 2** Does not apply: the exhibit does not show analysis results
- **Table 1** Reproduced
- **Figure 3** Reproduced
- **Table 2** Reproduced
- **Figure 4** Reproduced
- **Table 3** Reproduced
- **Table 4** Reproduced
- **Table 5** Reproduced
- **Figure 5 - Panel A** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *Figure5_tpres.pdf*.
- **Figure 5 - Panel B** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *Figure5_satt.pdf*.
- **Figure 5 - Panel C** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *Figure5_fac.pdf*.
- **Figure 5 - Panel D** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *Figure5_math.pdf*.
- **Figure 5 - Panel E** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *Figure5_eng.pdf*.
- **Figure 5 - Panel F** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *Figure5_urdu.pdf*.

Results in Appendix

For the Appendix, we did not review every exhibit. Instead, we randomly selected 10 exhibits from the remaining datasets to assess the appendix. Our review was based on those 10 exhibits. Since they were chosen randomly, we are operating under the assumption that if all randomly selected exhibits are reproducible, then the rest should be as well. The seed used to generate the random selection was 584895, the Stata version used was 17.0, and the exhibits selected were: Table B2, B4, B5, B7, B8 C2; Figure B3, B4, D1, D7.

- **Table B2** Reproduced
- **Figure B3 - Panel A** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB3_tpres.pdf*.
- **Figure B3 - Panel B** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB3_satt.pdf*.
- **Figure B3 - Panel C** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB3_fac.pdf*.
- **Figure B3 - Panel D** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB3_math.pdf*.
- **Figure B3 - Panel E** Reproduced. The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB3_eng.pdf*.

- **Figure B3 - Panel F Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB3_urdu.pdf*.
- **Figure B4 - Panel A Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB4_tpres.pdf*.
- **Figure B4 - Panel B Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB4_satt.pdf*.
- **Figure B4 - Panel C Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB4_fac.pdf*.
- **Figure B4 - Panel D Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB4_math.pdf*.
- **Figure B4 - Panel E Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB4_eng.pdf*.
- **Figure B4 - Panel F Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureB4_urdu.pdf*.
- **Table B4 Reproduced**
- **Table B5 Reproduced**
- **Table B7 Reproduced**
- **Table B8 Reproduced**
- **Table C2 Reproduced**
- **Figure D1 - Panel A Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD1_tpres.pdf*.
- **Figure D1 - Panel B Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD1_satt.pdf*.
- **Figure D1 - Panel C Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD1_fac.pdf*.
- **Figure D1 - Panel D Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD1_math.pdf*.
- **Figure D1 - Panel E Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD1_eng.pdf*.
- **Figure D1 - Panel F Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD1_urdu.pdf*.
- **Figure D7 - Panel A Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD7_tpres.pdf*.
- **Figure D7 - Panel B Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD7_satt.pdf*.
- **Figure D7 - Panel C Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD7_fac.pdf*.
- **Figure D7 - Panel D Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD7_math.pdf*.
- **Figure D7 - Panel E Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD7_eng.pdf*.
- **Figure D7 - Panel F Reproduced.** The exhibit was compared against the file *FigureD7_urdu.pdf*.

Reproduction Environment

Paper exhibits were reproduced on a computer with the following specifications:

- OS: Windows 10 Enterprise, version 22H2
- Processor: Intel(R) Xeon(R) Platinum 8562Y+ 2.80 GHz (2 processors)
- Memory available: 32.0 GB
- Software version: StataNow 18.5 MP-Parallel Edition